The Pygmalion Effect across Academic Levels in an HBCU: Reflections on Service-Learning Experiences

Kishwar Joonas
Prairie View A&M University

This study relates to the Pygmalion Effect, a type of self-fulfilling prophecy, as initiated and observed among undergraduate hybrid and graduate online students in a historically black institution of higher education (HBCU). The study purpose is to examine the documented Pygmalion Effect occurring within student teams in Service-Learning courses. Results evidence a stronger effect on students' goals-personal, academic, and professional- in comparison to institutional goals. The study also covers the match between goals set by the professor, and goals achievement perceived by students. Further, differences across different academic levels are observed and discussed. Study limitations, contributions, and directions for future research are also discussed.

INTRODUCTION

Over 50 years since *Brown v. Board of Education*, historically black colleges and universities (HBCU's) continue to enroll 11 per cent and graduate 20 per cent of all African American undergraduates (NCES, 2010). Further, a large number of students from this racial minority aspiring for post-graduate and specialized education obtain their basic degrees at HBCU's (NCES, 2010). Historically black colleges and universities (HBCU's) typically have an open admission policy, with minimal entry standards, and primarily cater to African-American students from socially and economically underprivileged sections of society. Often, such students resort to low-paying jobs as a financial necessity, further compromises the requisite nine hours per week of self-study and preparation for every three-hour credit course. By definition, a large proportion of HBCU's may be described as " at-risk" of failure, and graduation rates lag behind the national average. Absence of adequate resources and time, coupled with a lack of pre-requisite academic excellence, limits co-op and internship opportunities. As a result, there is an exponential increase in the challenge of educating such students, and of making them gainfully employable (e.g., Albritton, 2012; Gasman and Commodore, 2014). In light of HBCUs' providing access to higher learning among African Americans, thus contributing to the country and society, it becomes important to find paths to ensure their success and growth.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Service-Learning finds roots in the 1968 Critical Pedagogy thesis (Freire, 2006, English translation), which calls for the liberation of students from oppression, and recognizes their role in the creation of knowledge. Moreover, Service-Learning represents an implementation of the Social Constructivist Perspective (SCP) (e.g. Palincsar, 1998) via reciprocity, collaboration, and reflection. Further, Service

Learning is defined as experiential learning that speaks to human and community needs through a structure created to enhance learning and development through reciprocity and reflection (Jacoby and Associates, 1996). The Pygmalion Effect concept is rooted in Thomas' (1928, p. 572) theorem, which states that "If men define situations as real, they are real in their consequences". Pygmalion Effect has found considerable attention in recent literature (e.g. Inamori and Analoui, 2010; Kierein and Gold, 2000; Kopelman, Prottas, and Davis, 2008; Paglis 2010; Walumbwa, Avolio, and Zhu, 2010). Effective teachers make sure to communicate performance expectations to students, increasing students' individual and team efficacy toward project completion. Some authors adopted a general organizational behavior approach. These authors subscribe to the view that the Pygmalion Effect represents the study of human behavior within an organizational milieu, and of the interaction between human behavior and the organization. Thus, students conceive of themselves as being a part of the organization of the community partner, even though this is not a fact in the formal sense of being paid employees, and attempt to fulfill their perceived role in delivering a quality project to the community partner or "client" (e.g. Appelbaum, Ritchie, and Shapiro, 1994; Chen, Gully, and Eden, 2004; Guidice and Cullen, 2007; and Knouse, 1993).

Other researchers used the leadership framework, which views the Pygmalion Effect through a lens of social influence, through which a person recruits assistance and cooperation from a group to achieve a given objective outcome (e.g., Kelloway and Barling, 2000; McCullough and Faught, 2014; and Wayne, Shore, and Linden 1997). In relation to our research, the professor, through their strength emanating from knowledge and experience, marshals the aid of student teams to study the market of the community partner, and to complete a project for this "client". An organizational expectations approach was taken by some researchers (Lindsley, Brass, and Thomas, 1995; Wong and Hui, 2006). Certain researchers framed the Pygmalion Effect as innovative behavior, through applying superior solutions that meet new, unarticulated, or existing needs, through providing improved ideas that are ready to use (e.g., Schyns, 2004). Still other researchers interpreted the Pygmalion Effect in terms of quality management, which ensures consistency or reliability in an organization, product or service. The main components of quality management include quality planning, quality control, quality assurance and quality improvement. Attention is paid to the product as well as service quality; in addition, focus is on methods by which these are attained. The importance of quality management in the Pygmalion Effect thus utilizes quality assurance as well as control of processes and output to attain more consistent quality (e.g., Waldman, 1994). In the present research, the professor provides a structure for project completion, closely defining the tasks, timelines, and standards, to assure a quality project is delivered to the community partner. An example of an educational setting was Farias, Farias and Fairfield (2010).

The expression "self-fulfilling prophecy" is not wholly accurate (Eden and Shani, 1982; Eden, 1990; Eden, 1992), since it is not the prophecy that fulfills itself, but the "prophet" as catalyst that initiates a chain reaction with predicts impact. Hence the theory and empirical research results are convincing. Thus, the professor lays the groundwork for students, and provides them with a map to reach the destination of satisfying the needs of the client of "community partner". It appears that the Pygmalion Effect on learning and student engagement, merit a greater scrutiny (e.g., Stoicescu and Ghinea, 2014).

Despite the wide range of research on the subject, there is scant research attention on the Pygmalion Effect in minority and HBCU educational institutions. This gap will potentially be filled with the present study. In general during any course work, students complete various activities for assessment of learning such as testing, writing assignments, and presentations. Rarely are students asked to stand back and reflect on the purpose of such activities, and how they relate to predefined goals. Further, professors shy away from setting a high bar for students, particularly in minority institutions serving predominantly underprivileged students, and achieving student learning through extensive team-based written and experiential assignments. Reasons commonly cited are time, cost, and apathy and indolence among students. Further, the use of Service-Learning is less common at the graduate level, due to greater work and family priorities. Moreover, the richness of student interface in face-to-face teams is generally perceived as more appropriate for Service-Learning, compared with online interface.

Research questions were:
1. In HBCU Service-Learning courses, does the Pygmalion Effect occur, and to what extent?
2. In HBCU team Service-Learning courses, what is the match between goals set by the professor, and goals achievement perceived by students?
3. Are there any differences in the Pygmalion Effect, and in goals match based on academic level, between undergraduate and graduate students?

STUDY 1 – UPPER-LEVEL UNDERGRADUATE HYBRID COURSE

Methodology

The sample comprised 35 undergraduate students enrolled in a two senior level Marketing courses at an HBCU business school in southern US. Students were primarily from a racial minority, and aged 21-23 years. Students were placed in three to four teams per course. Each team was assigned to a real-life client or "community partner". The community partner visited with class to provide a marketing brief. Under the professor's guidance, each team was responsible to identify appropriate readings, which were then validated by representative of the Reference Library of the University. Further, each team was responsible to summarize each selected article, and to complete a literature review, validate for originality via the eCourse Turnitin function, and formatted in APA style with support from the Center for Business Communication of the College.

Team interaction was facilitated by team Discussion Forums on the eCourse. The professor provided structured discussion threads on the Discussion Forum to facilitate the team effort. A clear set of criteria were provided for the project, and about a third of class time was utilized for face-to-face interaction between instructor and students, as well as for team-based discussions. Frequent feedback was provided as the assignment progressed. After midterm, each team was responsible to create a full-fledged integrated marketing communications campaign for the assigned product. Thereafter, each team completed a presentation to the community partner, as well as external judges from outside and within the university, comprising industry, administrators, staff, and graduate assistants. Individual grades were based on the quality of team submission, as well as average peer evaluations received from the team. The project was graded for about 30-35% of course points. After project completion, students were asked to individually submit their reflections. Course goals were outlined in the course syllabus at the start of the semester. Students were provided with a Student Interest Inventory comprising an open-ended questionnaire covering the achievement of four major goals- those of the College and University, as well as students' professional and personal goals. In addition, for reference, students were provided with a link to the goals and objectives of the University and the business school. Also, students were requested to refer to their own personal and professional goals that were submitted as part of a separate assignment early in the semester. The Discussion Forum for reflections was set up in open format with all responses being visible to all the students and was available for posting for about three weeks. For submitting their reflections, regardless of length or quality of content, students were given a nominal 5% of the total assignment points, or .5% of total course points.

A descriptive analysis of reflections was then undertaken. To answer Research Question 1, items reflecting goals achievement were ranked based on clusters of responses (i.e. frequency of mentions for a given goal achieved). To answer Research Question 2, a comparison was made between the classification of goals achieved, as reflected by students' responses, and the framework provided by the professor.

Summary of Findings
Existence and Level of the Pygmalion Effect.
   Course Objectives. Every student reported complete achievement of each of the course objectives. Across all courses, 100% achievement of course goals was reported (see Table 1).
   Other Goals: Goals reportedly achieved by students were classified as High (over 40% of respondents), Medium (10-39% of respondents), and Low (below 10% of respondents). (See Table 2).

High level of goal achievement. The highest rating of over seven-tenths of respondents reported achieving the goals of "Critical Thinking/Problem-solving" (71.43%) through the Service-Learning project. The percentage of students that felt they had achieved "Project management/getting the job done" and "Integration of knowledge" was 57.14. About half of respondents reported the project's "Career and long-term relevance/ Advancement" (51.43%). The percentage reporting that the project helped them become a "Team player", and improve their "Team Work" was 51.43% and 48.57% respectively. Similarly, high ratings were assigned to "Leadership and Professional development" (40.0%), and "Conducting research" (40.0%).

Medium level of goal achievement. An equal number of respondents reported achieving "Help a client/community partner" (31.43%) and "Personal development" (31.43 %). Also, and equal number of students felt that the project help achieve institutional goals ("University goals" and College of Business (COB) goals"= 28.57% each). Over a fourth of respondents believed they achieved "Effective communication" (25.71%). The achievement of "Value of time/keeping deadlines/responsibility" was reported as achieved by a fifth of respondents.

Low level of goal achievement. Some goals with a relatively low level of perceived achievement such as "Collaborating/load sharing" (8.57%). In addition, specific institutional goals showed low ratings such as "University research goals" (8.57%), "University teaching goals", and "University service goals" (5.71% each), as well as "COB research goals", "COB service goals", and COB teaching goals" (2.86% each). Other goals that received low ratings (2.86%) included "Global perspective", "Use of technology", and "Community development".

TABLE 1
NARRATIVE- ACHIEVEMENT OF BBA COURSE, PROFESSIONAL, PERSONAL AND INSTITUTIONAL GOALS

Goal achieved	Frequency	% of respondents	Level of achievement
Course, Professional and Personal Goals			
Problem-solving	25	71.43	High
Project management- get the job done	20	57.14	High
Integration of knowledge	20	57.14	High
Team player	18	51.43	High
Career and long-term relevance/Advancement	18	51.43	High
Team work	17	48.57	High
Leadership/professional development	14	40.00	High
Conducting research	14	40.00	High
Help client/community partner	11	31.43	Medium
Personal development	11	31.43	Medium
Effective communication	9	25.71	Medium
Value of time/ deadlines/ responsibility	7	20.00	Medium
Relevant to future education	6	17.14	Low
Collaboration/ Load Sharing	3	8.57	Low
Advancement	3	8.57	Low
Global perspective	1	2.86	Low
Use of technology	1	2.86	Low
Community development	1	2.86	Low

Institutional Goals			
PVAMU goals- general	10	28.57	Medium
COB goals- general	10	28.57	Medium
PVAMU goals- research	3	8.57	Low
PVAMU goals- teaching	2	5.71	Low
PVAMU goals- service	2	5.71	Low
COB goals- research	1	2.86	Low
COB goals- teaching	1	2.86	Low
COB goals- service	1	2.86	Low
N	35		

TABLE 2
ACHIEVEMENT OF COURSE OBJECTIVES- UPPER-LEVEL
UNDERGRADUATE HYBRID COURSE

Course Objectives: At the end of this course, the student will	
1	Demonstrate an understanding of the IMC foundation
2	Demonstrate an understanding of IMC advertising tools
3	Demonstrate an understanding of the IMC promotional tools
4	Demonstrate an understanding of the IMC integration tools
5	Be able to create and present a team-based IMC project verbally as well as in writing
6	Be sensitized to the various perspectives of the new business environment: ethical, social, political, legal, economic, global, and environmental.

From the above, we find an answer to our first research question- there is a Pygmalion Effect in operation. The professor provided a well-defined course assignment, along with a vision of success, and continuous real-time feedback. These actions empowered students to believe in their own ability, cooperating with peers, to shape up to achieve goals. Finally, students were conscious of their goals achievement, and were able to successfully verbalize their reflections.

Match Between Professor's Goal-setting and Students' Perceived Achievement of Goals
As discussed earlier, students were asked to reflect on the achievement of specific goals at the end of the team Service-Learning assignment. Every student reported that the course objectives were achieved (see Table 1).

As an example, a student reflection stated, "This Integrated Marketing Communications project helped me achieve the course goals and objectives by introducing real world practices and tools that will be useful with my degree. Advertising and promotional tools and techniques that I will need in corporate America as marketing major were leaned from the project. Also, it has helped me achieve the University goals and objectives set by the COB for marketing and management students which will be the basis for my success in my field. I have work to attain dedication toward excellence in teaching, research, and service which is the schools' mission. Throughout this IMC project I have developed my professional goals by learning to meet deadlines within a timely fashion and learning to work in groups with others to accomplish a common goal. Also, I have learned to take instruction from my peers and criticism on my work to produce a better product. It has also enhanced my personal development skills in helping me become more punctual, a better speaker, and a better written communicator. This class has prepared me

for the business world beyond college and has raised my confidence for my marketing career soon to come."

In general, it may be concluded that there exists a high level of match in goals classification between professor and students. A reason might be that the sample comprises students in a hybrid course format, with a high level of communication as well as feedback from the professor. In addition, students' understanding of goals is application-oriented, leading them to take ownership in terms of course as well as professional goals. However, the perception of achieving institutional goals was relatively lower.

STUDY 2 – UPPER-LEVEL GRADUATE ONLINE COURSE

Methodology

The sample comprised 32 incoming graduate students enrolled in An upper- level Marketing course at an HBCU business school in southern US. Students were primarily from a racial minority, and aged 26-35 years. Students were placed in four teams, and each team evaluated an undergraduate student team's research completed in the previous semester, and titled "A Literature Review of Current Issues in Consumer Behavior in Emerging Economies", and covered four countries- Brazil, India, China and South Africa. The evaluation was performed in partial completion of the course requirements, and as a service to the Business School (which was the customer or community partner), to help in establishing assurance of learning with AACSB, an accrediting body. Team interaction was facilitated by team Discussion Forums on Moodle supported eCourses. The professor provided structured discussion threads on the Discussion Forum to facilitate the team effort. A clear set of criteria were provided for evaluation, and frequent feedback was given as the assignment progressed. The evaluation was graded for about 10% of course points. After the evaluation, graduate students were asked to individually provide their reflections. They were provided with a student interest inventory comprising an open-ended questionnaire covering the achievement of four major goals- those of the College and University, as well as students' professional and personal goals. In addition, for reference, students were provided with a link to the goals and objectives of the University and the business school. Also, students were requested to refer to their own personal and professional goals that were submitted as part of a separate assignment early in the semester. The Discussion Forum for reflections was set up in open format with all responses being visible to all the graduate students and was available for posting for about three weeks. For submitting their reflections, regardless of length or quality of content, students were given a nominal 5% of the total assignment points, or .5% of total course points.

A descriptive analysis of reflections was then undertaken. To answer Research Question 1, items reflecting goals achievement were ranked based on clusters of responses (i.e. frequency of mentions for a given goal achieved). To answer Research Question 2, a comparison was made between the classification of goals achieved, as reflected by students' responses, and the framework provided by the professor.

Summary of Findings
Does the Pygmalion Effect Occur, and to What Extent?

Goals reportedly achieved by students were classified as High (over 40% of respondents), Medium (12-39% of respondents), and Low (below 12% of respondents). (See Table 3).

High level of goal achievement. Almost four-fifths of respondents believed that Service-Learning provided them with a "Global perspective". Over three-fifths felt they had achieved "being able to work within a team". "Effectiveness in communication" was reported by over half the respondents. "Realization of their full potential by individuals of diverse backgrounds" was cited by half of the respondents. In addition, over two-thirds of respondents felt they had accomplished "good grades", and were "closer to program completion".

Medium level of goal achievement. A fourth of the respondents believed they achieved "being able to collaborate and share work within the team". Over a fifth of respondents stated that" research and ethical goals" were achieved. Reaching the goals of "critical thinking", and of "problem-solving", was reported by 18.78% of the respondents. Several students felt that the Service-Learning experience was "relevant to

their present jobs", and "helped understand the value of time, keeping deadlines, and taking their responsibility seriously", and "problem-solving skills" (15.63% of respondents for each goal). Further, an eighth of respondents reported achieving each of the following goals: "leadership", "being a better team player", and "being qualified for professional advancement".

Low level of goal achievement. Some goals with a low level of perceived achievement were the "use of technology", and "conducting research" (almost 10% of respondents). In addition, "integration of knowledge", and "quantitative skills" were mentioned by 6.25 of the respondents, followed by "becoming a better consumer", "understanding the business environment", and "development of the community" (3.13% of respondents).

TABLE 3
NARRATIVE- ACHIEVEMENT OF MBA/MSA COURSE, PROFESSIONAL, PERSONAL AND INSTITUTIONAL GOALS

Goal achieved	Frequency	% of respondents	Level of achievement
Course, Professional and Personal Goals			
Global perspective	25	78.13	High
Team work	20	62.5	
Communication	17	53.13	
Individuals of diverse backgrounds to realize their full potential	16	50.00	
Good grade, complete MBA/MSA degree	14	43.75	
Collaboration/ Load Sharing	8	25	Medium
Research	7	21.88	
Ethics	7	21.88	
Critical thinking	6	18.75	
Problem-solving	5	18.75	
Relevant to present job	5	15.63	
Value of time/deadlines/responsibility	5	15.63	
Leadership	4	12.5	
Team player	4	12.5	
Advancement	4	12.5	
Use of technology	3	9.375	Low
Conducting research	3	9.375	
Integration of knowledge	2	6.25	
Quantitative skills	2	6.25	
Better consumer	1	3.125	
Environment of business- race/ gender/equality	1	3.125	
community development	1	3.125	
N	32		

TABLE 4
ACHIEVEMENT OF COURSE OBJECTIVES- UPPER-LEVEL GRADUATE ONLINE COURSE

	Course Objectives/Accrediting Body (AACSB) Standards Met
	At the end of this course, the student will
1	Demonstrate an in-depth understanding of Marketing Management and decision-making, covering areas listed below, and their inter-relationships.
2	Demonstrate an understanding of the Marketing, and capturing insights
3	Demonstrate an understanding of connecting with customers
4	Demonstrate an understanding of building strong brands
5	Demonstrate an understanding of shaping the marketing offerings
6	Demonstrate an understanding of delivering value
7	Demonstrate an understanding of communicating value
8.	Demonstrate an understanding of creating successful long-term growth
9	Demonstrate communication skills via online discussion forums
10.	Demonstrate teamwork skills via online discussion forums

From the above, we find an answer to our first research question- there is a Pygmalion Effect in operation. The professor provided a well-defined course assignment, along with a vision of success, and continuous real-time feedback. These actions empowered students to believe in their own ability, cooperating with peers, to shape up to achieve goals. Finally, students were conscious of their goals achievement, and could verbalize their reflections.

Is There Congruence Between Goals Classification by the Professor and by Students?

As discussed earlier, students were asked to reflect on the achievement of specific goals at the end of the team Service-Learning assignment. A distinction was made by the professor, between objective or institutional goals (university, business school, and program), and students' subjective or individual goals (professional and personal). However, results indicate that students perceive institutional goals as being professional or personal in nature, and vice versa. Thus there seems to be a hazy distinction, if any, as to the nature of goals. As an example, some students specified "Problem-solving skills" as a personal goal. Another example is that numerous students stated "Global perspective, "Problem-solving skills", and "Research skills" as satisfying professional goals, rather than institutional goals. As an example, a student reflection stated, "… A part of any business is to have the ability to demonstrate a set of skills such as a code of ethics, teamwork, and effective communication all which aligns with both *University and Business School goals* expected from this *program.* Having established these goals, the critical appreciation research assignment provided an opportunity to build and enhance this skill set by creating a collaborative working structure that required effective communication amongst members and distributing work formed through our own words and opinions.

Although the *University goals and the Business School goals* are relatable in some sense, the distinguished items are "being able to integrate learned knowledge" and "being able to critically solve problems". While both are relatively important, even if one applied the learned knowledge, to not be able to solve for a solution defeats the purpose, as can be seen in the following reflection. "In both my *personal and professional life* it is important that I am able to demonstrate the two, allowing me to be a well-diversified asset and candidate for an open position as well as a well-rounded figure in society. This assignment for example will now help me to better understand consumer complaints on a developed spectrum, and applying that knowledge I too can implement a solution when presented with a similar scenario within my company."

Another student wrote, "I believe I was able to use this assignment towards my *personal goals* by gaining more exposure to the world of Marketing Management. The assignment helped me gain more in

depth information regarding surveys and questionnaires about the areas of study in the country. Working with athletes overseas and marketing their brands is truly a *personal goal* of mine and this assignment helped me gain more exposure to not only the country itself but also how to effectively gain ground in other countries to make an individual's brand gain more attention in the particular country that they represent."

DISCUSSION

As discussed earlier, several inherent values were built into the Service-Learning assignment framework by the professor. As an example, all undergraduate research papers being evaluated were based on consumer behavior in emerging economies, and many papers included cross-cultural comparison between these emerging economies, and other countries, including the West, thus providing a "Global perspective". Further, the Service-Learning assignment was based on teams comprising about 10 members each in the graduate course, and up to eight members in the undergraduate course, thus speaking to the goal of "Team work". Moodle-based eCourse Forum Discussion provided a platform for the team to develop their assignment, which spoke to the goal of "Effectiveness in Communication". As an extension of this goal, a "Collaboration" was called for, and a reasonable level of was achieved. The same may be said for goals such as "Critical thinking" and "Problem-solving".

Results show that the professor was successful in inspiring students experience and become conscious of their achievement of these goals. However, even if the professor was successful in inspiring students to achieve other goals, it appears that students either did not adequately pick up on these cues, or did not report achieving them for other reasons. Moreover, as discussed above, there was not a complete congruence of goals as conceived of by the professor, and as understood and interpreted by students. In future, it might help to avoid open-ended essay type reflections, but instead to provide a student interest inventory comprising a list of goals, classified into Institutional, Professional, and Personal goals, with a Likert-type rating scale for each item.

Further, among graduate students, it may be said that the congruence in goals attainment was effective; however, congruence in goals classification appears to be lower than expected across the board. A reason might be that the sample comprises graduate students; their understanding of goals is application-oriented, leading them to take ownership in terms of professional goals.

Our research has numerous implications for research as well as practice. Findings of our studies support the Pygmalion Effect concept as reiterated in current literature. As an example, our findings support Thomas' (1928, p. 572) theorem of the Pygmalion Effect that states: "If men define situations as real, they are real in their consequences". The professor defined the decision dilemma of the community partner as a real-life business problem, and students responded by adopting a realistic attitude to problem-solving on behalf of the community partner. Further, the crucial role of the professor lay in enunciating organizational expectations (e.g., Lindsley et al., 1995, Wong, and Hui, 2006). Moreover, the professor, in order to be effective, communicated performance expectations to students, increasing students' individual and team efficacy and course performance (e.g., Inamori and Analoui, 2010, Kierein and Gold, 2000, Kopelman et al. 2008, Paglis 2010, Walumbwa et al., 2010). The professor as well as students adopted a leadership approach in harnessing their knowledge and expertise in service to the community partner (e.g. Kelloway and Barling, 2000, McCullough and Faught, 2014, and Wayne et al. 1997). Our research confirms and extends the organizational behavior approach to the Pygmalion Effect. Student groups envisioned themselves in the role of employees in the community partner's organization and demonstrated an ability to deliver a quality project in a timely fashion (e.g. Appelbaum et al. 1994, Chen et al. 2004, Guidice and Cullen, 2007, and Knouse, 1993).

Further, our research exemplifies and extends knowledge of the Pygmalion Effect in the leadership framework. The professor, harnessing superior knowledge and experience, was successful in harnessing the talent of student groups to study the market of the community partner, and to complete a project for this "client" (e.g., Kelloway and Barling, 2000, McCullough and Faught, 2014, and Wayne et al. 1997). In addition, through our research, we demonstrated the organizational expectations approach, in that

client" or community partner expectations were translated into a doable class projects by the professor, and students teams shaped up to those expectations during the course of an academic semester (e.g., Lindsley et al., 1995, Wong, and Hui, 2006). It may be concluded that the Service-Learning project implementation demonstrated the Pygmalion Effect as innovative behavior, through providing better solutions that meet community partner' new, unarticulated, or existing needs, by creating projects based on new ideas that are readily implementable (e.g., Schyns 2004). Moreover, our research confirms and extends the quality management view of the Pygmalion Effect. The professor defined project values to include both process and output dimensions to achieve quality output from disparate student teams (e.g., Waldman 1994). In the present research, the professor provides a structure for project completion, closely defining the tasks, timelines, and standards, to assure a quality project is delivered to the community partner. Additionally, our research demonstrates how the professor provided student teams with a map of how to achieve a quality project, to satisfy the organizational objectives of the community partner. This is consistent with view that "self-fulfilling prophecy" is not wholly accurate, as it was not the prophecy that was fulfilled on its own, but the "prophet" or professor as catalyst set off a chain reaction with effected specific outcomes (Eden and Shani, 1982, Eden, 1990, Eden, 1992).

Our studies, as described above, overall confirm and extend current research. Further, there is scant research attention on the Pygmalion Effect in minority and HBCU educational institutions; our studies fill this gap. During any course work, students typically complete various activities for assessment of learning such as testing, writing assignments, and presentations. Only rarely are students asked to step back and think deeply on their purpose, and their relationship to institutional, professional, and personal goals. Often, professors hesitate to set a high bar for students, especially in minority institutions serving predominantly at-risk and underprivileged students. The achievement of student learning through extensive team-based written and experiential assignments is a lesser-witnessed phenomenon, attributed to issues such as time, cost, and apathy and indolence among students. Moreover, application of Service-Learning is less common at the graduate level, on account of student demographics, characterized particularly by greater priority to work and family. Moreover, the richness of student interface in face-to-face teams is generally perceived as more appropriate for Service-Learning, compared with online interface. Availability of data relating to these populations is relatively rare. In all the areas enumerated above, our research represents significant contributions to the extant state of knowledge on the Pygmalion Effect.

Results this research will help HBCUs to better serve their audience of socially and economically underprivileged students. African American students will be able to obtain financial more avenues of financial resources to support their education, and break the cycle of holding low-paying jobs for a greater focus on course preparation. HBCUs would be able to address the issue of "at-risk" students, and to improve recruitment of quality students, as well as in higher retention and increased graduation rates. Team research and service-learning would substitute for experience gained from co-ops and internships, thereby improving employability. The present study will help HBCUs to improve the quality of higher learning, providing quality access to African Americans, thus ensuring increased growth and national contribution.

LIMITATIONS

This study is not free of issues. As an example it was for the first time that a Service-Learning assignment was completed by graduate students at the HBCU business school. In the absence of institutional memory, the concept of Service-Learning, reviewing undergraduate student research papers, and writing reflections may have been a novel activity for most students. In addition, the sample comprised only 32 students from a graduate class in a single institution, and 35 students from two undergraduate classes in the same institution. A larger sample size might have generated a greater diversity of responses. Using a frame of two or more HBCU institutions would also allow for identifying organizational factors in the Pygmalion Effect. In addition, students were provided with a link to the University as well as College of Business goals and objectives. Also, students were requested to refer to

their own personal and professional goals that were submitted as part of an assignment early in the semester. Unaided recall might have yielded different results. Further, the Discussion Forum for student reflections, set up in open format (i.e., responses were visible to all students in class) was available for posting for about two weeks. Typically, students complete online assignment posting very near Discussion Forum's closing time; however, despite this fact, there is a possibility that later responses were affected by team and class posts that were completed at an earlier time. In addition, all goals in the student interest inventory were presented with the same order, without rotation. This fact, along with the fatigue experienced by students as they progressed through the inventory, might also have biased the results. Finally, reflection on goals achievement comprised a very small part of the Service-Learning assignment, and results might have been different if it were framed as a separate assignment. Future research might be formulated to overcome some of these limitations. Given the above limitations, it may be concluded that the Pygmalion Effect on learning and student engagement, merit a greater scrutiny (e.g., Stoicescu and Ghinea, 2014).

CONCLUSION

The present exploratory study confirms and extends current research on the Pygmalion Effect, and some mechanics through which it can be achieved. Further this study provides support for the existence and extent of the Pygmalion Effect in an HBCU, a research area that has received scant research attention. In addition, the present study evidences the manner in which the Pygmalion Effect works within a hybrid delivery and undergraduate-level environment. Further, this study highlights a match in the nature of objective goals- as set by the professor and perceived by students.

The value of this research to academic practitioner rests in benefits, including those beyond teaching and learning, such as for the purposes of funding and training. Additionally, the importance of this study to administrators lies in its serving as an instrument to "close the loop", in providing evidence of learning for accreditation agencies, and to access avenues of public as well as private funds. In general, faculty will benefit from the study, in its support for motivation of students toward achievement of institutional, academic, professional, and personal goals. The study will benefit students themselves, in giving them a comprehension of the professor as "prophet" being crucial in students' achievement of their own professional and personal goals, while at the same time feeding into institutional goals. To conclude, Service-Learning as a pedagogical tool with a track record of benefits to academic stakeholders is supported by this study.

REFERENCES

Albritton, Travis J. (2012). Educating our own: The historical legacy of HBCUs and their relevance for educating a new generation of leaders. *The Urban Review,* 44(3): 311-331. http://dx.doi.org.pvamu.idm.oclc.org/10.1007/s11256-012-0202-9.

Appelbaum, S. H., Ritchie, S., & Shapiro, B. T. (1994). Mentoring revisited: An organizational behavior construct. *The Journal of Management Development*, 13(4), 62. Retrieved from http://ezproxy.pvamu.edu/login?url=http://search.proquest.com/docview/216348035?accountid=7062.

Chen, G., Gully, S. M., & Eden, D. (2004). General self-efficacy and self-esteem: Toward theoretical and empirical distinction between correlated self-evaluations. *Journal of Organizational Behavior*, 25(3), 375-395. Retrieved from http://ezproxy.pvamu.edu/login?url=http://search.proquest.com/docview/224879864?accountid=7062.

Eden, D. (1990), "Pygmalion controlling interpersonal contrast effects: Whole groups gain from raising expectations", *Journal of Applied Psychology*, Vol. 75, pp. 394-398.

Eden, D. (1992), "Leadership and expectations: Pygmalion effects and other self-fulfilling prophecies in organizations", *Leadership Quarterly*, Vol. 3, No. 4, pp. 271-305.

Eden, D. and Shani, A.B. (1982). "Pygmalion goes to boot camp: Expectancy, leadership, and trainee performance", *Journal of Applied Psychology*, Vol. 67, pp. 194-199.

Farias, G., Farias, C. M., & Fairfield, K. D. (2010). Teacher as judge or partner: The dilemma of grades versus learning. *Journal of Education for Business*, 85(6), 336-342. Retrieved from http://ezproxy.pvamu.edu/login?url=http://search.proquest.com/docview/759962861 ?accountid=7062.

Freire, Paulo. *Pedagogy of the Oppressed, 30th Anniversary edition.* New York: Continuum, 2006. Gasman, Marybeth, and Commodore, Felicia. (2014). The state of research on historically Black colleges and universities. Journal for Multicultural Education, 8(2): 111-89.

Guidice, R. M., & Cullen, J. B. (2007). A strong inference test of the effects of strategic interdependence on the JV control-performance relationship. *Journal of Business and Management*, 13(2), 127-153. Retrieved from http://ezproxy.pvamu.edu/login?url= http://search.proquest.com/docview/211515405?accountid=7062.

Inamori, T., & Analoui, F. (2010). Beyond Pygmalion effect: The role of managerial perception. *The Journal of Management Development*, 29(4), 306-321. doi:http://dx.doi.org/ 10.1108/02621711011039132.

Jacoby and Associates. *Service-Learning in Today's Higher Education.* In B. Jacoby (ed) Service-Learning in Higher Education. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 1996.

Kelloway, E. K., & Barling, J. (2000). What we have learned about developing transformational leaders. *Leadership & Organization Development Journal*, 21(7), 355-362. Retrieved from http://ezproxy.pvamu.edu/login?url=http://search.proquest.com/docview/226918740 ?accountid=7062.

Kierein, N. M., & Gold, M. A. (2000). Pygmalion in work organizations: A meta-analysis. *Journal of Organizational Behavior*, 21(8), 913-928. Retrieved from http://ezproxy. pvamu.edu/login?url=http://search.proquest.com/docview/224880292?accountid=7062.

Knouse, S. B. (1993). Issues, theory, and research in Industrial/Organizational psychology. *Personnel Psychology*, 46(4), 876. Retrieved from http://ezproxy.pvamu.edu/login? url=http://search.proquest.com/docview/220143533?accountid=7062.

Kopelman, R. E., Prottas, D. J., & Davis, A. L. (2008). Douglas McGregor's theory X and Y: Toward a construct-valid measure. *Journal of Managerial Issues,* 20(2), 255-271,159-160. Retrieved from http://ezproxy.pvamu.edu/login?url=http://search.proquest.com/ docview/194165861?accountid=7062.

Lindsley, D. H., Brass, D. J., & Thomas, J. B. (1995). Efficacy-performance spirals: A multilevel perspective. *Academy of Management. The Academy of Management Review,* 20(3), 645. Retrieved from http://ezproxy.pvamu.edu/login?url=http://search.proquest.com/ docview/210970418?accountid=7062.

McCullough, P. M., & Faught, S. (2014). Paradoxes of organizational effectiveness. *International Journal of Business and Social Science*, 5(9) Retrieved from http:// ezproxy.pvamu.edu/ login?url=http://search.proquest.com/docview/1618188590? accountid=7062.

National Center for Education Statistics, Institute of Education Sciences, U.S. Department of Education. (2010). *Integrated Postsecondary Education Data System (IPEDS), Graduation Rates component.* DC: Washington.

Paglis, L. L. (2010). Leadership self-efficacy: Research findings and practical applications. *The Journal of Management Development*, 29(9), 771-782. doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/ 02621711011072487.

Palincsar, A.S. (1998). *Social constructivist perspectives on teaching and learning.* Annual Review of Psychology, 49, 345-375.

Schyns, B. (2004). The influence of occupational self-efficacy on the relationship of leadership behavior and preparedness for occupational change. *Journal of Career Development,* 30(4), 247-261. Retrieved from http://ezproxy.pvamu.edu/login?url=http://search. proquest. com/docview/220430206?accountid=7062.

Stoicescu, S. T. C., & Ghinea, V. M. (2013). Pygmalion teaching style: Is there a need for it? *Management & Marketing*, 8(4), 699-722. Retrieved from http://ezproxy.pvamu.edu /login?url=http://search.proquest.com/docview/1503088539?accounti=7062.

Thomas, W.I. (1928).*The Child in America: Behavior Problems and Programs*, Alfred A. Knopf, New York.

Waldman, D. A. (1994). The contributions of total quality management to a theory of work performance. Academy of Management. *The Academy of Management Review,* 19(3), 510. Retrieved from http://ezproxy.pvamu.edu/login?url=http://search.proquest.com/ docview/210968489?accountid=7062.

Walumbwa, F. O., Avolio, B. J., & Zhu, W. (2008). How transformational leadership weaves its influence on individual job performance: The role of identification and efficacy beliefs. *Personnel Psychology,* 61(4), 793-825. Retrieved from http://ezproxy.pvamu.edu/login? url=http://search.proquest.com/docview/220138744?accountid=7062.

Wayne, S. J., Shore, L. M., & Linden, R. C. (1997). Perceived organizational support and leader-member exchange: A social exchange perspective. *Academy of Management Journal,* 40(1), 82-111. Retrieved from http://ezproxy.pvamu.edu/login?url=http://search.proquest. com/docview/199819927?accountid=7062.

Wong, Joe T.Y., & Hui. Eddie C.M. (2006). Research notes - Power of expectations. *Property Management,* 24(5), 496-506. doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/02637470610710547.